

1 **PLANNING & ZONING HISTORICAL APPROPRIATENESS COMMISSION**

2 **Work Session**

3 **September 8, 2009**

4 **5:00 PM**

5
6 **COMMISSIONERS:** John Sullivan, Chair David Rockstraw
7 Gayle Lewis John Nelson (absent)
8 Dax Contreras

9
10 **STAFF:** Nick Eckert, CDD Rosanne Herrera, Recorder
11 Gina Gentile, BI

12
13 **PUBLIC:** Mary Jansen Nora Barraza
14

15 **1. Case: 090102; 2270 Calle de Principal, San Albino Church, a cert. of**
16 **appropriateness/building permit. Zone: HC.**

17
18 Mr. Eckert stated the case had been through several meetings with various members of staff and
19 Commission contacting several entities for guidance. Most of the recommendations referred back
20 to the secretary of interior standards and also stressed being careful with the wall that provided
21 structural support. There was communication with SHPO and feedback was provided stating that
22 the proposals would not detract from the overall historic classification. Commissioner Sullivan
23 and Eric Leifeld went over the proposal and the process and Mr. Leifeld provided an overview
24 report of the meeting. Both properties were listed as significant structures on the historic register
25 therefore the detailed process of review was to establish what was correct and what could and
26 could not be done.

27
28 Chairman Sullivan stated he went through the building with Mr. Leifeld and Father Richard. He
29 felt there were two independent structures with each building having 22" thick walls. They were
30 not able to establish the outer thickness of the adobe walls between the two buildings.

31
32 It was discussed that it would be difficult to anticipate what was within the walls without further
33 investigation and it would have to be presumed that the walls were historic until further testing
34 was done. A suggestion was made that the applicants ask for guidance from Eric Leifeld
35 regarding the walls.

36
37 The Commission felt that the secretary of interior standards were directing them to look for any
38 and all methods of accomplishing the new needs of the building without altering historic
39 materials. If the wall was opened and historic material removed they were not complying with
40 the secretary of interior standards. The Commission felt that an opening in the wall should not be
41 allowed until further research was done to determine its historic significance.

42
43 After all discussion, the final recommendation to the applicant was that the applicant submit
44 alternate plans that would not involve structural changes to the existing building and also the
45 applicant was encouraged to have an evaluation/assessment of the existing wall where the new
46 opening was being proposed to determine the wall thickness and whether or not previous
47 openings had existed.

48
49 **PLANNING & ZONING HISTORICAL APPROPRIATENESS COMMISSION**

50 **Regular Meeting**

1 **Vote:** Motion carried by unanimous vote (**summary:** Yes = 4).

2 **Yes:** Chairman Sullivan, Commissioner Contreras Commissioner Lewis, Commissioner
3 Rockstraw

4 **Absent:** Commissioner Nelson

5
6 **3. Case: 0361; 2060 Calle de Parian, Genevieve Trevino for Gena's & Shellie's Boutique, a**
7 **business license application: Zone HC.**

8
9 **Motion: Action:** Approve Case 0361 **Moved by** Commissioner Rockstraw **Seconded by**
10 Commissioner Contreras

11
12 Mr. Eckert this application was for a general retail location off the Plaza. The new parking
13 ordinance mandated many of the Plaza businesses that did not have the appropriate parking to pay
14 a \$100 maintenance fee. The application met all other requirements.

15
16 **Vote:** Motion carried by unanimous vote (**summary:** Yes = 4).

17 **Yes:** Chairman Sullivan, Commissioner Contreras Commissioner Lewis, Commissioner
18 Rockstraw

19 **Absent:** Commissioner Nelson

20
21 **4. Case: 090118; 2222 Avenida de Mesilla, Alexandra Hall, a building permit application**
22 **for a re-roof. Zone: HC.**

23
24 **Motion: Action:** Approve Case 090118 **Moved by** Commissioner Rockstraw **Seconded by**
25 Commissioner Contreras

26
27 Mr. Eckert stated that the applicant was proposing to change the roofing material from asphalt
28 shingles to a corrugated metal roof which was an allowed material in the historic district. He
29 noted that in the preservation brief #4 it stated that a substitution of material might seriously alter
30 the architectural character of the building.

31
32 Alexandra Hall, owner stated that the significance of the structure had already been altered at
33 some point in time. She did not want to perpetuate a semi modern shingle roof and preferred a
34 roof that belonged in the historic district. She felt that this material was predominant in the
35 development zone.

36
37 Commissioner Rockstraw felt that changing the roof material would not change the historical
38 features of the house, but would rather be preserving them for the future.

39
40 Staff felt that the metal style roof was the predominant style in the development zone, the ease of
41 maintenance and the mixture of additions were all justification for the new material and
42 precedence would not be set because of these individual factors.

43
44 **Vote:** Motion carried by unanimous vote (**summary:** Yes = 4).

45 **Yes:** Chairman Sullivan, Commissioner Contreras Commissioner Lewis, Commissioner
46 Rockstraw

47 **Absent:** Commissioner Nelson

48
49 **5. Case: 090119; 2346 Calle de Principal, J. Paul Taylor, a building permit application for**
50 **a fence. Zone: HC.**

51

1 **Motion: Action:** Approve Case 090119 **Moved by** Commissioner Lewis **Seconded by**
2 Commissioner Contreras

3
4 Staff stated this was mainly a privacy fence approximately three ft in height. It would be a
5 wrought iron fence with an adobe wall pillar made with allowed materials.

6
7 **Vote:** Motion carried by unanimous vote (**summary:** Yes = 5).

8 **Yes:** Chairman Sullivan, Commissioner Contreras Commissioner Lewis, Commissioner Nelson,
9 Commissioner Rockstraw

10
11 **6. Case: 090121; 1950 Calle del Norte, Dick's Café, a building permit for mural painting.**
12 **Zone: HC.**

13
14 **Motion: Action:** Approve Case 090121 **Moved by** Commissioner Rockstraw **Seconded by**
15 Commissioner Lewis

16
17 Mr. Eckert stated the application was for a mural on the front façade of the Dick's Café area
18 underneath the awning area. The proposal was for leaves, vines and yucca type plants with
19 approved colors. The building was not listed as significant, but was intrusive which made the
20 proposal possible.

21
22 **Vote:** Motion carried by unanimous vote (**summary:** Yes = 4).

23 **Yes:** Chairman Sullivan, Commissioner Contreras Commissioner Lewis, Commissioner
24 Rockstraw

25 **Absent:** Commissioner Nelson

26
27 *A public hearing must be held prior to the following case:*
28 *Open Public Hearing: 6:37pm*

29
30 *Closed Public Hearing: 6:38*

31
32 **7. Case: 090020; NM 292 & Avenida de Mesilla, Sommer Grove Subdivision, an**
33 **application for final plat approval. Zone: HR.**

34
35 **Motion: Action:** Approve Case 090120 **Moved by** Commissioner Lewis **Seconded by**
36 Commissioner Contreras

37
38 Mr. Eckert stated there had been several work sessions and meetings with the P&Z regarding this
39 case. The proposal was for an 11 lot subdivision of which 10 of the lots would be new houses.
40 The applicant requested variances on the 35' right of way and lot frontages on lots four through
41 seven. The subdivision is zoned HR and could have potentially had a larger number of lots in the
42 area. Molzen-Corbin reviewed the construction drawings for the engineering components and a
43 summary of the changes was included in the packets. The applicant made all changes requested.
44 The layout and design remained the same as the preliminary plat. The variances were granted in
45 the preliminary plat stage and the construction drawings were fine. It was noted that the
46 developer would maintain the roadway for the first two years after which the Town of Mesilla
47 would take full responsibility for the roadway.

48
49 **Vote:** Motion carried by unanimous vote (**summary:** Yes = 3, Abstain =1).

50 **Yes:** Chairman Sullivan, Commissioner Contreras Commissioner Lewis

1 **Abstained:** Commissioner Rockstraw

2 **Absent:** Commissioner Nelson

3
4 ***ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS:**

5 8. Case: 090109; 2941 McDowell Rd., John Sullivan, a building permit for a re-roof. Zone: R-1.

6 9. Case: 090110; 1937 Calle de Parian, Debbie Pinkerton for the Purple Lizard, a temp. sign
7 permit. Zone: HC.

8 10. Case: 090111; 2011 Avenida de Mesilla, Eric Payan, a building permit application for
9 repainting bldg. Zone: HC.

10 11. Case: 090112; 1401 W. Boutz Rd, Annette Schaefer, a building permit for a pool. Zone: RF.

11 12. Case: 090113; 2428 Calle de Santiago, Dorothy Barclay, a building permit for a re-roof.
12 Zone: HR.

13 13. Case: 090114; 2000 Happy Valley Lane, Mike Poloner, a building permit for a rock wall.
14 Zone: RF.

15 14. Case: 090115; Dona Ana Arts Council, a temporary sign permit for 2329 Calle de Guadalupe,
16 1910 Calle de Parian, and 2470 Calle de Guadalupe-A.

17 15. Case: 090116; 3380 McDowell, Jon Hunner, a building permit for garage conversion.
18 Zone:R-1.

19 16. Case: 090117; 1991 Calle de Santiago, Esther Gallegos, a building permit for window
20 replacement. Zone: HC.

21 17. Case: 090120; 1730 Tierra de Mesilla, Body Worx, a sign permit for sandwich board sign.
22 Zone: C.

23
24 **PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

25
26 Alexandra Hall thanked the Commission for their attention to details.
27

28 **STAFF COMMENTS:**

29
30 **PZHAC COMMENTS:**

31
32 **PZHAC ADJOURNMENT:**

33 **Motion: Action:** Adjourn **Moved by** Commissioner Lewis **Seconded by** Commissioner
34 Contreras

35
36 The meeting was adjourned at 6:47 p.m.
37
38
39
40

41 _____
42 John Sullivan, Commission Chairman